



The York Water Company
 One Page Summary: Public Comments to the Environmental Quality Board
 Regarding Proposed Rulemaking
 (25 Pa. Code Chapter 109)
 Disinfection Requirements Rule, (46 Pa.B. 857)
 April 18, 2016

Respectfully, The York Water Company does not support the Department's efforts to amend Chapter 109 as put forth in the Disinfection Requirements Rule. Our comments directly reflect those put forth by the Disinfection Requirements Rule Stakeholder Workgroup.

- 1) There is no clear or present public health threat is being addressed by the proposed rule.
- 2) Although The York Water Company agrees with the stated goal of the Department to address the minimum detectable residual and low chlorine distribution disinfectant residuals, The York Water Company does not agree that the minimum residual should be set at 0.2 mg/L.
- 3) The York Water Company agrees that the current minimum distribution system detectable residual of 0.02 is not valid and believes the minimum residual should be set at 0.1 mg/L. The current regulatory language should only change the 0.02 mg/L to 0.1 mg/L and keep all other existing language.
- 4) Increasing the minimum disinfectant level in the distribution system from the existing 0.02 mg/L to 0.1 mg/L (for both free & total chlorine) is a 5-fold increase from the current level. A minimum value of 0.1 mg/L is a responsible level given the Departments concerns. However, the proposed 0.2 mg/L does not provide any additional health benefits to our customers, but it does require additional capital improvements & operating costs.
- 5) We agree with the compliance calculation of the proposed rule for systems serving greater than 33,000 people is 95% in 2 consecutive months and the compliance calculation for systems serving 33,000 or fewer people is 75% in 2 consecutive months. However, we are concerned that the increased residual monitoring (from once/month to once/week) will significantly increase small system operating costs.
- 6) The claimed compliance benefits in the proposed rule are unfounded and the associated compliance costs are dramatically underestimated (see table below). Over \$60-million CAPEX and >\$4-million annual OPEX will be spent for the 15 utilities shown in the table below to meet the proposed residual of 0.2-mg/L; far exceeding the \$780,000 cost projection in the Preamble.
- 7) Disinfection byproducts (DBPs) are likely to increase for many utilities as a result of increasing the distribution disinfection residual to 0.2 mg/L. Setting the minimum residual at 0.1 mg/L will allow time for utilities to assess impacts to DBPs. Not only are DBPs presently regulated, but some are recognized as health hazards.
- 8) Taste & odor complaints will increase if the minimum distribution disinfection residual is set at 0.2 mg/L.
- 9) Heterotrophic Plate Count (HPC) should be retained as an alternative compliance criteria for CWS's when the distribution disinfectant residual is below the minimum required level. This is still allowed under the federal regulation and will reduce the number of instances where Public Notice (PN) is required. The TAC Board also agrees, voting 12-0-1 to retain HPC as an alternative compliance criteria in low residual situations.
- 10) Because no known health risks have been identified in this proposed rulemaking, requiring water utilities to issue Tier 2 PN for failing to meet 0.2 mg/L will unnecessarily erode public confidence in water quality. This is another justification for setting the minimum distribution disinfection residual at 0.1 mg/L and continuing to allow HPC as an alternative compliance method.
- 11) The York Water Company requests that the Comment and Response document be provided to the advisory committees when a draft-final regulation is presented for their input.

Estimated Costs of Compliance With Proposed Disinfection Requirements Rule
 All estimates provided after February 15, 2016 and targeted at the 0.2-mg/L Residual Requirement

	Philadelphia Water Department (PWD)	Aqua Pennsylvania	Suez Water	PA-American Water	The York Water Company	Pittsburgh Water and Sewer	North Penn Water	Chester Water Authority	Capital Region Water	Bucks County Water and Sewer	Western Berks Water Authority	Lehigh County Water Authority	City of Lancaster Water Department	Bethlehem Water Dept.	Erie Water	Totals	Percent of Pennsylvania's "Population Served by Public Water" Represented in this Table by these Suppliers	
Source of Cost Estimates	Public Record Submittals/PAPER	Phone Interviews	Phone Interviews	Phone Interviews	Internal Estimates	Phone Interviews	Phone Interviews	Phone Interviews	Phone Interviews	Phone Interviews	Phone Interviews	Phone Interviews	Phone Interviews	Phone Interviews	Phone Interviews		68%	
Population Served	1,700,000	1,400,000	165,000	2,200,000	190,000	500,000	85,000	138,000	60,000	200,000	35,000	128,000	130,000	115,000	220,000	7,256,000		
CAPEX Estimate (total \$)	\$25,000,000	\$7,150,000	\$2,000,000	\$13,100,000	\$3,000,000	\$0	\$6,000,000	\$1,033,000	\$25,000	\$200,000	\$300,000	\$25,000	\$500,000	\$25,000	\$1,800,000	\$60,158,000	CAPEX Estimate (total \$)	
OPEX Estimate (Increased \$/year to comply)	\$2,500,000	\$300,000	\$100,000	\$735,000	\$600,000	\$0	>0	\$3,600	\$7,000	>0	\$20,000	\$15,000	\$25,000	\$210,000	>0	\$4,515,600	OPEX Estimate (Increased \$/year to comply)	
Combined Ten Year Cost (\$) [CAPEX + (OPEX x 10-yr)]	\$50,000,000	\$10,150,000	\$3,000,000	\$20,450,000	\$9,000,000	\$0	\$6,000,000	\$1,069,000	\$95,000	\$200,000	\$500,000	\$175,000	\$750,000	\$2,125,000	\$1,800,000	\$105,314,000	Combined Ten Year Cost (\$) [CAPEX + (OPEX x 10-yr)]	
Number of Waterborne Disease Outbreaks Directly Attributed to Supplier over last 30-years (see premise plumbing - suppliers.com NOT central DBP of P2)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	Number of Waterborne Disease Outbreaks Directly Attributed to Supplier over last 30-years (see premise plumbing - suppliers.com NOT central DBP of P2)

Douglas J. Crawshaw

Water Quality Manager, The York Water Company

THE YORK WATER COMPANY
 TEL. (717)845-3601

130 E. MARKET STREET
 YORK, PENNSYLVANIA 17401

www.yorkwater.com
 FAX (717)852-0058